

Q1.1⁺

CLAIM

Let \succeq be a transitive and complete preference relationship on the consumption set $X = \mathbb{R}_+^L$. Then the following are equivalent:

C1 For every sequence $\{x^n\}$ and $\{y^n\}$ in X such that $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x^n = x$, $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} y^n = y$ and $x^n \succeq y^n$, it holds $x \succeq y$.

C2 For every $x \in X$, the preferred-to- x set $\{y \in X \mid y \succeq x\}$ and the lower contour set $\{y \in X \mid x \succeq y\}$ are closed.

Proof

C1 \Rightarrow C2

Let $x \in X$ be given. Consider the sequence $\{x^n\} = x$ and any convergent sequence $\{y^n\}$ such that $y^n \succeq x \forall n$. $x^n = x \Rightarrow y^n \succeq x^n$. By C1, $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} y^n = y \succeq x$. Thus $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} y^n \in \{y \in X \mid y \succeq x\}$ for any convergent $\{y^n\} \subset \{y \in X \mid y \succeq x\}$, so $\{y \in X \mid y \succeq x\}$ is closed.

By a symmetric argument $\{y \in X \mid y \preceq x\}$ is closed.

C2 \Rightarrow C1*

Let $\{x^n\}$ and $\{y^n\}$ in X be such that $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x^n = x$, $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} y^n = y$ and $x^n \succeq y^n \forall n$. Let $\{p \in X \mid p \succeq q\}$ and $\{p \in X \mid p \preceq q\}$ be closed $\forall q \in X$. Suppose for contradiction that $x \prec y$.

$\{p \in X \mid p \succeq q\}$ closed implies that its complement, $\{p \in X \mid p \prec q\}$, is open

$\{p \in X \mid p \preceq q\}$ closed implies that its complement, $\{p \in X \mid p \succ q\}$, is open.

Lemma $\exists z \in X$ such that $x \prec z \prec y$

Suppose for contradiction $\nexists z$ such that $x \prec z \prec y$. Then $\forall z \in X$ $x \succeq z$ or $y \preceq z$

Thus $z \in \{p \in X \mid p \succeq y\} \cup \{p \in X \mid p \preceq x\} = X = \mathbb{R}_+^L$.

Also $x \prec y \Rightarrow \{p \in X \mid p \succeq y\} \cap \{p \in X \mid p \preceq x\} = \emptyset$

$\{p \in X \mid p \succeq y\}$ and $\{p \in X \mid p \preceq x\}$ closed \mathbb{R}_+^L is contained in two closed, disjoint sets \Rightarrow

\mathbb{R}_+^L not connected CONTRADICTION, so $\exists z \in X$ such that $x \prec z \prec y$.

+ Also Econ 8101, Fall 2007 PS3 *2

* I thank Hitoshi Tsujiyama for the approach.

Q 1.1 (cont'd)

$$y \succ z \Rightarrow y \in \{p \in X \mid p \succ z\}. \quad \{p \in X \mid p \succ z\} \text{ open} \Rightarrow \exists \varepsilon_1 > 0 \text{ such that } B(y, \varepsilon_1) \subset \{p \in X \mid p \succ z\}$$

$$x \prec z \Rightarrow x \in \{p \in X \mid p \prec z\}. \quad \{p \in X \mid p \prec z\} \text{ open} \Rightarrow \exists \varepsilon_2 > 0 \text{ such that } B(x, \varepsilon_2) \subset \{p \in X \mid p \prec z\}$$

$$\text{Since } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} y_n = y, \exists N_1 \text{ such that } \forall m > N_1, y_m \in B(y, \varepsilon_1) \subset \{p \in X \mid p \succ z\}$$

$$\text{Since } \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} x_n = x, \exists N_2 \text{ such that } \forall m > N_2, x_m \in B(x, \varepsilon_2) \subset \{p \in X \mid p \prec z\}$$

$$\text{Let } k > \max(N_1, N_2) \quad y_k \in \{p \in X \mid p \succ z\} \Rightarrow y_k \succ z$$

$$x_k \in \{p \in X \mid p \prec z\} \Rightarrow x_k \prec z$$

By transitivity $x_k \prec y_k$. CONTRADICTION, so $y \succ x$. ■

A preference relation is transitive if $\forall a, b, c$ such that $a \succeq b$, $b \succeq c$, then $a \succeq c$

A preference relation is complete if $\forall x, y$, $x \succeq y$, $x \preceq y$, or both