## Midterm 1—Suggested Answers

1. (a) Given the following linear program,

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \min _{\pi \in \mathbb{R}^{3}} \pi_{1}+\pi_{2}+\pi_{3} \text { subject to } \\
& \pi_{1}+\pi_{2} \geq 1 \\
& \pi_{1}+\pi_{3} \geq 1 \\
& \pi_{2}+\pi_{3} \geq 1 \\
& \pi_{1}, \pi_{2}, \pi_{3} \geq 0
\end{aligned}
$$

its dual is given by

$$
\begin{array}{r}
\max _{\sigma \in \mathbb{R}^{3}} \sigma_{1}+\sigma_{2}+\sigma_{3} \text { subject to } \\
\sigma_{1}+\sigma_{2} \leq 1, \\
\sigma_{1}+\sigma_{3} \leq 1, \\
\sigma_{2}+\sigma_{3} \leq 1, \\
\sigma_{1}, \sigma_{2}, \sigma_{3} \geq 0 .
\end{array}
$$

Adding the primal constraints, it follows that $\pi_{1}+\pi_{2}+\pi_{3} \geq 1.5$. Adding the dual constraints, it follows that $\sigma_{1}+\sigma_{2}+\sigma_{3} \leq 1.5$. The vector $\pi=\left(\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right)$ is a feasible primal solution with value 1.5 , and the vector $\sigma=\left(\frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{1}{2}\right)$ is a feasible dual solution with value 1.5. By duality, $1.5 \leq V=W \leq 1.5$, therefore $\pi$ is an optimal primal solution and $\sigma$ is an optimal dual solution.
(b) If $\alpha \leq \frac{3}{2}$ then the additional constraint $\pi_{1}+\pi_{2}+\pi_{3} \geq \alpha$ doesn't affect the problem, so the solution is the same as before. If $\alpha>\frac{3}{2}$ then the value of the problem equals $\alpha$ with an optimal solution $\pi=\left(\frac{\alpha}{3}, \frac{\alpha}{3}, \frac{\alpha}{3}\right)$. This is clearly feasible, since $\frac{\alpha}{3}+\frac{\alpha}{3}=\frac{2 \alpha}{3}>1$.
2. (a) We are given the linear program:

$$
\begin{aligned}
V(\alpha)=\max _{x_{1}, x_{2}} x_{1}+2 x_{2} \text { subject to } & \\
x_{1}+\frac{8}{3} x_{2} & \leq 2 \alpha \\
x_{1}+x_{2} & \leq \alpha \\
2 x_{1} & \leq 3 \\
x_{1}, x_{2} & \geq 0 .
\end{aligned}
$$

The dual of this problem is given below:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& W(\alpha)=\min _{y_{1}, y_{2}, y_{3}} 2 \alpha y_{1}+\alpha y_{2}+3 y_{3} \text { subject to } \\
& y_{1}+y_{2}+2 y_{3} \geq 1, \\
& \frac{8}{3} y_{1}+y_{2} \geq 2, \\
& y_{1}, y_{2} \geq 0 .
\end{aligned}
$$

Since the slope of the isovalue line lies between the slopes of the first and second constraints, the optimal solution will solve

$$
\begin{aligned}
x_{1}+\frac{8}{3} x_{2} & =2 \alpha \\
x_{1}+x_{2} & =\alpha,
\end{aligned}
$$

yielding $\left(x_{1}^{*}, x_{2}^{*}\right)=\left(\frac{2}{5} \alpha, \frac{3}{5} \alpha\right)$, as long as $x_{1}^{*} \leq 3 / 2$, i.e., as long as $\alpha \leq 15 / 4$. If $\alpha>15 / 4$ then $\left(x_{1}^{*}, x_{2}^{*}\right)=\left(\frac{3}{2}, \frac{4 \alpha-3}{16}\right)$. The remaining optimal solutions as well as the value are tabulated below.

| $\alpha$ | $x^{*}$ | $V=W$ | $y^{*}$ | $2 y_{1}^{*}+y_{2}^{*}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\alpha<0$ | $\emptyset$ | $-\infty$ | unbounded | unbdd |
| $\alpha=0$ | $(0,0)$ | 0 | any feasible $\left(y_{1}, y_{2}, 0\right)$ | $+\infty$ |
| $0<\alpha<15 / 4$ | $\left(\frac{2}{5} \alpha, \frac{3}{5} \alpha\right)$ | $\frac{8}{5} \alpha$ | $\left(\frac{3}{5}, \frac{2}{5}, 0\right)$ | $\frac{8}{5}$ |
| $\alpha=15 / 4$ | $\left(\frac{3}{2}, \frac{9}{4}\right)$ | 6 | $\left\{\lambda\left(\frac{3}{5}, \frac{2}{5}, 0\right)+(1-\lambda)\left(\frac{3}{4}, 0, \frac{1}{8}\right): \lambda \in[0,1]\right\}$ | $\left[\frac{3}{2}, \frac{8}{5}\right]$ |
| $15 / 4<\alpha$ | $\left(\frac{3}{2}, \frac{12 \alpha-9}{16}\right)$ | $\frac{3}{2} \alpha+\frac{3}{8}$ | $\left(\frac{3}{4}, 0, \frac{1}{8}\right)$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ |

Therefore, $2 y_{1}^{*}+y_{2}^{*}$ coincides with the slope of $V(\alpha)$.


The remaining graphs can be drawn from the table above.
(b) Now suppose that $\alpha=1$ is fixed, and vary $\beta$ in the linear program below.

$$
\begin{aligned}
V(\alpha)=\max _{x_{1}, x_{2}} x_{1}+2 x_{2} \text { subject to } & \\
x_{1}+\frac{8}{3} x_{2} & \leq 2 \\
x_{1}+x_{2} & \leq 1+\beta \\
2 x_{1} & \leq 3+\beta \\
x_{1}, x_{2} & \geq 0
\end{aligned}
$$

The dual of this problem is given below:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& W(\alpha)=\min _{y_{1}, y_{2}, y_{3}} 2 y_{1}+(1+\beta) y_{2}+(3+\beta) y_{3} \text { subject to } \\
& y_{1}+y_{2}+2 y_{3} \geq 1, \\
& \frac{8}{3} y_{1}+y_{2} \geq 2, \\
& y_{1}, y_{2} \geq 0 .
\end{aligned}
$$

Using the same techniques as the previous problem leads to the following table:

| $\beta$ | $x^{*}$ | $y^{*}$ | $y_{2}^{*}+y_{3}^{*}$ |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\beta<-1$ | $\emptyset$ | $-\infty$ | unbounded | unbdd |
| $\beta=-1$ | $(0,0)$ | 0 | unbounded | unbdd |
| $-1<\beta<-\frac{1}{4}$ | $(0,1+\beta)$ | $2(1+\beta)$ | $(0,2,0)$ | 2 |
| $\beta=-\frac{1}{4}$ | $\left(0, \frac{3}{4}\right)$ | $\frac{3}{2}$ | $\left\{\lambda(0,2,0)+(1-\lambda)\left(\frac{3}{5}, \frac{2}{5}, 0\right): \lambda \in[0,1]\right\}$ | $\left[\frac{2}{5}, 2\right]$ |
| $-\frac{1}{4}<\beta<1$ | $\left(\frac{2+8 \beta}{5}, \frac{3(1-\beta)}{5}\right)$ | $\frac{8+2 \beta}{5}$ | $\left(\frac{3}{5}, \frac{2}{5}, 0\right)$ | $\frac{2}{5}$ |
| $\beta=1$ | $(2,0)$ | 2 | $\left\{\lambda\left(\frac{3}{5}, \frac{2}{5}, 0\right)+(1-\lambda)(1,0,0): \lambda \in[0,1]\right\}$ | $\left[0, \frac{3}{5}\right]$ |
| $1<\beta$ | $(2,0)$ | 2 | $(1,0,0)$ | 0 |

Now, the slopes of $V(\beta)$ correspond to $y_{2}^{*}(\beta)+y_{3}^{*}(\beta)$, since in this case the third primal constraint never binds, so $y_{3}^{*}(\beta)=0$ for all $\beta$.

